

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 29 November 2018 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 23 November 2018.

Present: County Councillor Dianne Rees (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ahmed, Asghar Ali, Dilwar Ali, Bale, Berman, Bowden, Bowen-Thomson, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Carter, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ford, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Henshaw, Gavin Hill-John, Hinchey, Howells, Hudson, Jacobsen, Jenkins, Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Lancaster, Lay, Lent, Lister, Mackie, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Molik, Naughton, Owen, Parkhill, Jackie Parry, Keith Parry, Patel, Phillips, Robson, Sandrey, Sattar, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Lynda Thorne, Walker, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong and Wood

93 : ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Lord Mayor thanked the pupils and teachers of Hawthorn Primary School and Emma Coulthard from the Council's Music Service who had been invited to perform a song composed by Emma especially for the launch of the Cardiff Child Friendly City Strategy.

The Lord Mayor also welcomed pupils from the School Council at St Philip Evans Roman Catholic Primary School who were observing part of the meeting and had met with the Lord Mayor and officers from the Protocol office and Democratic Services prior to the meeting.

94 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for Absence had been received from Councillors Burke Davies, Congreve, P Hill-John, Morgan and Murphy.

The Lord Mayor on behalf of the Council sent her best wishes to Councillor Jim Murphy who was currently unwell.

95 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declaration of interest was received in accordance with the Members Code of Conduct: -

<b>Councillor</b>	<b>Item</b>	<b>Interest</b>
Councillor Hudson	Item 11 - Cabinet Member, Social Care. Health & Well-being – Statement.	Personal Interest as a family member is in receipt of Social Care Services.

<b>Councillor</b>	<b>Item</b>	<b>Interest</b>
Councillor Hudson	Item 12 – Motion 1	Personal Interest as a non-licensed breeder of less than 5 dogs.
Councillor McEvoy	Item 12 – Motion 1	Personal Interest as a Member of the Welsh Assembly who proposed an amendment on the issue of Lucy’s Law in the recent Assembly debate.
Councillor Naughton	Item 13 – Motion 2	Personal Interest as a family member suffers from Alzheimer.
Councillor Williams	Item 13 – Motion 2	Personal Interest as a member of the Board of Management of Caretref homes.
Councillors Gavin Hill-John, Lay, Patel, Robson, Sandrey, Simmons and Stubbs	Item 16 – Cardiff Bus – Appointment of Independent Non-Executive Directors	Personal Interest as Non-Executive Directors of Cardiff Bus appointed by Council.

96 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting of the Council held on 25 October 2018 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson subject to the following amendments:

Min No: 85 - ANNUAL STATUTORY WELLBEING REPORT 2017-18 Page 104

Delete: “One amendment was received to the recommendation contained in the report and Councillor Berman was invited to propose the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Boyle.” and replace with:

“One amendment was received to the recommendation contained in the report, as follows:

Amended Cabinet proposal to read:

‘In the light of some of the concerns highlighted in the letter from the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee, the Council is recommended to defer consideration of the Annual Statutory Well-being Report 2017-18 until a future council meeting, and calls on the Cabinet to revise the report in the interim to ensure that the assessments of progress against the well-being objectives which it contains more accurately reflect the extent of reported progress against performance indicators and targets, particularly those relating to the safeguarding of people deemed to be at risk.’

Councillor Berman was invited to propose the amendment which was seconded by Councillor Boyle.”

Min No: 85 - ANNUAL STATUTORY WELLBEING REPORT 2017-18 Page 105

Correction to the recorded vote on the amendment

For (31) County Councillors Asghar Ali, Berman, Boyle, Carter, Cowan, Davies, Driscoll, Ford, Gavin Hill-John, Philippa Hill-John, Howells, Hudson, Jenkins, Jones-Pritchard, Kelloway, Lancaster, McKerlich, Molik, Morgan, Naughton, Owen, Parkhill, Keith Parry, Phillips, Robson, Sandrey, Taylor, Graham Thomas, Walker, Williams and Wood.

Against (37) County Councillors Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Bowden, Bowen Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke-Davies, Cunnah, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Henshaw, Hinchey, Jacobsen, Keith Jones, Owen, Lay, Lent, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Murphy, Jackie Parry, Patel, Sattar, Singh, Stubbs, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Weaver, Wild and Wong.

Not Present County Councillor McEvoy  
(1)

97 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

Public Question 1 – *Mr Troy Tyler*

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule Public 18 (i) the question was deemed as withdrawn as the questioner was absent.

Public Question 2 – *Mr Lee Canning*

Fake News and false claims have largely taken over social media, how is Cardiff Council ensuring 'Fake News' isn't accidentally pushed by its social media feeds?

Reply – *Councillor Huw Thomas*

The Council produces content for its social media channels, which goes through the same checks and balances as all other Council communications.

If anyone does spot anything on our social media accounts, which they believe is offensive or 'fake news', then we would ask them to report it.

Clearly, if any errors are made – and we become aware of those errors – then officers will look to put them right as soon as is practically possible by either deleting or muting the content so that it cannot be seen by our social media followers. What is harder to control is where people repeat 'fake news' about issues pertaining to the

Council, but don't tag us – there's no easy way for us to see or rectify those comments.

If people do make comments on our social media that are untrue, then we will either mute them or, where possible, respond with the correct information. However, it's important to remember that if some people write something that you disagree with, it is not necessarily offensive or 'fake news'.

Supplementary Question– *Mr Lee Canning*

No matter who publicises it, fake news can be quite distressing to some communities - if not all communities throughout Cardiff. Will you condemn the recent comments made by Cardiff Central AM Jenny Rathbone, and what measures will you be taking to ensure that at this stage the Council is not liable and will not propel that ideology, that sense of singling out certain communities; and does the Council at this stage disagree with some of her statements that actually suggest that the Israeli Government is not responsible and is not carrying out a relentless campaign against the Leader of Her Majesty's opposition Jeremy Corbyn?

Reply – *Councillor Huw Thomas*

That has no relevance to Council business, those statements weren't made in any forum relating to the Council.

I understand the Member for Cardiff Central has apologised for her comments and she was right to do so. There is an ongoing investigation so I'm not prepared to comment any further.

Public Question 3 – *Mrs Jodie Randall*

Why have the school buildings at Glan Yr Afon Primary School been allowed to deteriorate to such an extent that the Council justify this as one of the reasons why the school has to close?

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

The reason for the Council consulting to close Glan Yr Afon was to reduce the number of surplus places in schools in the Llanrumney area, not because of the condition of the buildings.

In January 2017, overall surplus capacity in primary school places in Llanrumney was 20%; in May 2018, the surplus capacity in Glan Yr Afon was 48%. This has an impact on the school in terms of their budget and, as the original cabinet report references, the school's ability to carry out maintenance and invest in their buildings.

Where there are any proposed changes to school provision due to surplus places, the Council must also consider the condition and suitability of buildings, quality and standards, and the effect of any changes on all stakeholders.

The Consultation Document for the proposed reorganisation set out that Glan Yr Afon Primary School has the same condition rating as Pen Y Bryn, Bryn Hafod, St Mellons Church in Wales Primary School and Ysgol Bro Eirwg.

The consultation period ended on 22<sup>nd</sup> October and, inevitably, parents have expressed their worries and concerns about any proposed changes to their child's school as part of this process. I totally understand those concerns and all I can state at the moment is that the responses, and how to proceed in light of the responses received, will be considered very carefully by the Cabinet at its meeting next month.

Supplementary Question– *Mrs Jodie Randall*

The Education Department states that Glan Yr Afon should close because of the fabric of the school building is in such a poor state and it is not worth putting the cost into maintaining it and get the school back up to standard.

After speaking to our local Councillors we have realised that out of the 5 schools in our area Glan yr Afon Primary School is also classed as being the same rating as four of the other schools.

Will the Council accept that there has been no investment in our school or the fabric of the school?

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

The school building for Glan Yr Afon is condition C it's not one of the worst school buildings but there is an issue in terms of the School Budget, they have less money to put repairs in and that probably will decline.

The reason for the proposal to close is based on the number of surplus places overall, all the schools in the area are condition C but Glan Yr Afon is the one with the largest surplus places, so what we now have to do is look at the responses that parents have made, we need to think is the original comment about number of vacant places – is that shown to be correct or not by responses to the consultation, but the other challenge we have to do even if we accept there is still surplus places, how do we come up with the best solution to resolve the situation.

There are two things we need to consider very carefully in light of the responses, the only reassurance I can give you is that we do give these things a great deal of thought and we will be weighing it very very carefully.

Public Question 4 – *Mr Lee Jones*

Why should children at Glan Yr Afon, an English Medium Primary School be sent to a Roman Catholic Primary School instead?

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

As I outlined in reply to the previous Public Question, the recent consultation regarding primary places in the Llanrumney area proposed the reduction of English-

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

medium community places to be achieved through the closure of Glan Yr Afon Primary School from the end of August 2019.

As a parent myself, I recognise that any proposed changes to your child's or children's school is worrying, but I would emphasise that no decisions have yet been taken in respect of closing the school. The consultation process was an opportunity for the Council to explain the proposal and to seek the views of all stakeholders who may be affected by it.

The Cabinet will meet on 13<sup>th</sup> December to consider all responses, and any alternative options suggested, when it will decide whether or not to proceed with the proposed changes.

The Council is not instructing parents to send their children to any specific school, nor would it do so, but for some parents this may be their preferred option.

If Glan Yr Afon Primary School were to close, all children could be placed in community primary schools within walking distance, if that is the parental preference.

Supplementary Question– *Mr Lee Jones*

The Education department's consultation was entitled English Medium Primary School places in the Llanrumney area. Our children who attend Glan Yr Afon want to attend an English Language Primary School as opposed to a Faith or Welsh Language Medium School. It is our children's right to be taught through the medium of English in Cardiff in their community as has been the case since the school was opened when the estate was built over five decades ago.

Why then are the Council saying that their answer to closing an English Medium School is for our children to attend a Roman Catholic Faith Primary School leaving with the School Governing Body agreeing, otherwise our children would be scattered across primary schools across the east of the City.

Will the Council give the children of Glan Yr Afon primary school who want to learn through the medium of English in Llanrumney a chance and if the Council will not make this commitment, will the Council commit to reopening the consultation under the new Welsh Governments School Organisational Code that came into force days after our consultation ended?. This places a duty on Local Authority's now to explain why closure is the most appropriate course of action.

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

As I said I do appreciate the concerns of the parents. There is no suggestion that anybody who does not wish to, should send their children to a Catholic School. There is a consultation separate to this that St Cadoc's is running because it is believed that may be an option that parents prefer. Nearly half the children at St Cadoc's are actually not Catholic as it is so it is clearly a choice that many parents in the area are making, but there is no suggestion whatsoever that any parent should make that choice if that isn't what they wish.

98 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were received:

<b>Councillor</b>	<b>No of signatures</b>	<b>Topic</b>
Councillor Berman	40 plus as not complete	Calling on the Council to incorporate a transport solution into the proposed housing development of the former Howardian Adult Learning Centre site to avoid the need for parents dropping off or collecting their children from Howardian Primary School to undertake three-point turns.
Councillor Jacobsen	500	Expressing residents concern with the plan to remove the Maelfa Cross Bridge and replace with two road crossings which they believe will adversely affect Elderly and disabled residents accessing the new shopping centre
Councillor Gordon	73	Calling on the council to urgently consider gating of the back lane that runs parallel with Teilo Street, Riverside.
Councillor Ahmed	492	Calling on the Council to allow the use of privacy glass in both Cardiff registered Hackney and Private Hire Vehicles.
Councillor Bale	536	Calling on the Council to erect 20mph signs to slow vehicles down outside Coed Glas Primary School, Llanishen.

99 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Lord Mayor on behalf of Elected Members of Cardiff Council expressed her sincere condolences to the Rev Canon Stewart Lisk whose mother sadly passed away on 23 November 2018. She advised that she had written to Stewart and his family on behalf of the Council. The funeral was to be held on Monday 10 December at 12.15pm in the Knave at Llandaff Cathedral.

The Lord Mayor welcomed the Chair of the Standards and Ethics Committee, Mr Richard Tebboth to the meeting to present the Committee's Annual Report 2017/18.

A report setting out the details of duties and events undertaken by the Lord Mayor had been published. The Lord Mayor was delighted to report that her Charity Fundraising for the Noah's Ark Tiny Lives Appeal had reached £51,800. The Lord Mayor thanked all who had supported the events or pledged donations over the last month.

The Lord Mayor encouraged Members and residents if they could to take part in the Noah's Ark Big Give Christmas Challenge where every pound donated will become

two pounds. Donations could be made on line before 12.00noon on Tuesday 4 December 2018.

#### 100 : STANDARDS & ETHICS COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2017-18

The Chair of Standards & Ethics Committee, Mr Richard Tebboth presented the Committee's [Annual Report for 2017/18](#). The Chair was pleased to welcome three new County Council Members and the return of an Independent Member Hollie Edwards Davies who had agreed to come back following the sudden and sad death of Thora Lewis shortly after taking up her office. The Chair also thanked the lead Council officers for their support and guidance.

The Chair was pleased to present the annual report which a marked improvement in conduct. The Committee however recognised that there was no room for complacency and that some Members had expressed concerns around bullying and unacceptable behaviours.

The Committee had continued its monitoring of Council Policies specifically relating to Standards and Ethics such as Whistleblowing and Gifts and Hospitality and had identified key priorities for the year ahead.

The Lord Mayor invited questions and observations from Members during which the following matters were raised:

- concerns that Members are still expressing concerns about discriminatory behaviour and bullying.
- the support of the Committee that these issues could best be tackled through education and the sharing of experiences was welcomed
- it was queried as to why the All Party Women's Group had been asked to look at discriminatory behaviour and bullying, as it could be a matter for any Councillor.
- An update on the current arrangements for the disclosure of Senior Officer Gifts and Hospitality which had been programme.
- a request that the Committee look at Councillors use of Social Media as a public engagement tool to publicise information within their communities about Council Services and Information how links to individual Facebook and twitter feeds for Councillors can be presented on website and business cards.

The Chair responded to the questions received and undertook to liaise with officers and consider how matters could be taken forward. The Chair asked that if there were specific matters around the topics raised that the Member felt needed to be considered then they could contact him directly. The Chair confirmed that Party Leaders and Whips had agreed to include the Independent Member/s in future informal meetings with the Committee.

The Lord Mayor thanked the Chair of Standards & Ethics for his report and responding to the Elected Members.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted.

#### 101 : TRIENNIAL STATEMENT OF GAMBLING POLICY

The Chair of Licensing Committee, Councillor Norma Mackie presented the Council's Statement of Gambling Licensing Policy for approval by Council following the triennial review. She advised that there were no major changes to the policy, however as part of the review consideration had been given to the consultation responses; legislative requirements including the principles of the Wellbeing and Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015; guidance on Gaming Machines and permitted machines; explanation in respect of unlicensed family entertainment centres; small society lottery; codes of practice and social responsibilities.

The proposal was seconded by Councillor Michael.

There was no further debate on this item.

#### RESOLVED – That

1. the Statement of Gambling Licensing Policy was approved for publication on 31<sup>st</sup> January 2019 and adopted for use on that date;
2. the Head of Shared Regulatory Services be authorised to make administrative amendments to the policy should the need arise.

#### 102 : COUNCIL TAX UNOCCUPIED DISCOUNTS & PREMIUMS

The Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation and Performance, Councillor Weaver, presented the Cabinet proposal to Council for the disapplication of the 50% discount for unoccupied and unfurnished dwellings and the discretionary powers available to the Local Authority in relation to applying the Council Tax Premium which would be subject to consultation.

The Cabinet Member set out the main principles of the proposal, and assured Council on the process in relation to exemptions in place for families who have to deal with properties left to them after the death. The proposal aimed to prevent long-term empty properties in communities which were a blight on communities and became targets of littering, fly-tipping and vandalism

The Cabinet Member, Housing and Communities seconded the proposal and drew attention to

- the need to bring properties back into use to provide safe, secure and affordable homes.
- reduce the current demand of over 8000 persons on the housing waiting list.
- provide housing in areas of high demand such as Adamsdown, Canton and Grangetown.
- provision accommodation opportunities for the homeless.
- the Council was itself reaching its target in getting its own properties back into used.

The Lord Mayor invited debate and there was general support to the proposal and positive encouragement for people to give up properties that are not being used or are in a state of disrepair.

Some concerns about the Council's own void properties and the challenges in this area were raised. It was unclear how many properties and income would be generated however the Cabinet Member advised that there was a level of uncertainty and the information in the report was prudent.

The consultation process was welcomed on the premium tax, however concerns were raised about the importance of managing property in the city and the impact of such a levy on some properties in the city that are empty over 12 months.

The Cabinet Member in response to the issue raised about Council Tax contributions indicated that Council Tax was only part of the funding allocated to services utilised by citizens across Cardiff.

The Cabinet Member welcomed the cross party support and underlined the importance of providing safe, suitable and affordable housing.

RESOLVED – That the Council agreed that the 50% council tax discount that is currently granted to unoccupied and unfurnished dwellings be discontinued with effect from 31<sup>st</sup> March 2019. This means that from 1<sup>st</sup> April 2019 there will be no discount awarded to these dwellings.

#### 103 : TREASURY MANAGEMENT MID - YEAR REPORT 2018- 19

The Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation and Performance, Councillor Weaver, presented the mid-year report on treasury Management activities since 1 April 2018 and the position as at 30 September 2018.

The Council's treasury management activities are undertaken in accordance with the policies adopted by Council and under professional codes of conduct established by CIPFA, the Welsh Government and the Corporate Director Resources as part of Treasury Management Practices. The mid-year report is part of a suite of reports that Elected Members receive on the Council's treasury management activities during the course of a year.

The Cabinet Member advised that the report provides an update as at 30 September 2018 and covers:-

- the economic background to treasury activities
- investments
- borrowing
- debt rescheduling
- compliance with treasury limits and prudential indicators
- Treasury strategy, accounting and Treasury Management Code update for remainder of year

Councillor Bowen -Thomson seconded the report.

The Lord Mayor invited debate and the following matters were raised:-

- the current level of borrowing and debt and the increasing level of maturity
- the cost of borrowing and likely increases in the Public Loans Board rates of interest
- the effect on revenue budget of the cost £32.2 m on interest
- the importance of benchmarking with 21 other Local Authorities to see how Cardiff stands in levels of reserves and debts.

The Cabinet Member recognised the issues raised which would be considered and debated further as part of the 2019/ 20 budget debate and the future budget strategy. It was a question of balancing investment and the impact on the revenue budget and services. He advised that reserves had increased in the last few year and any further increases would need to be balanced against the provision of services and workforce requirements, and investment in services.

RESOLVED – That the Treasury Management Mid-Year Report 2018-19 be noted.

#### 104 : LEADER AND CABINET MEMBER STATEMENTS

The following statements were received: -

1. [The Leader's Statement](#)

The Leader responded to questions raised on

- Fair funding for Local Authorities and representations to Welsh Government in respect of Cardiff's unique position
- Cardiff Public Services Board
- Cardiff Creative Sector and the Channel 4 Bid and whether the transport infrastructure to Cardiff I particular the Brynglas Tunnels affected the decision to award the bid to Bristol.

2. [Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation and Performance Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on

- Budget Consultation 2019/20 process and the need raised by Scrutiny Committees previously of the need to better engage with citizens in the south and the east of the city and hard to reach groups.
- A strategy for consulting young people as part of the city's aim as a Child Friendly City, including if possible children and young people in care.
- With the proposed increase in funding over the next 3 years whether it was proposed to still increase Council Tax by over 4%.
- The Wales Interpretation and Translation Service (WITS)
- The Cardiff Commitment website and involvement of small businesses.
- Welcome in increase in digital reporting and whether there had been an increase in reporting of such matters as Fly-tipping
- Asbestos Management – removal and replacement

3. [Cabinet Member, Housing & Communities Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on:

- Work of the Multi-Agency team for Homelessness and Rough Sleepers and measures in place to cope with a greater increase over the next year particularly over the winter period.
- Query around the alleged removal of tents by Council staff
- The work being undertaken on Private Sector High Rise Cladding
- The success of the Veterans Event at the Central Hub
- Query on the roll out of Wellbeing hubs in other wards such as Rhiwbina

4. [Cabinet Member, Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded questions on

- Glass Recycling Pilot and whether it had been successful and will be rolled out to other wards
- A design fault with the Glass caddies
- Central Transport Services Workshop and income generation
- Efforts being made to publicise Cardiff Dogs home who had won a Gold Award in the Stray Dogs category and Silver Award for Animal Activity Licensing in the recent RSPCA Cymru Community Animal Welfare Footprints Awards.

5. [Cabinet Member, Children & Families Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on

- Welsh Government Childcare offer and whether this would be expanded to other parts of the city.
- Feedback from the Staff engagement sessions
- Provision of Corporate Parenting Training for Elected Members

6. [Cabinet Member, Social Care, Health & Well-being Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded questions on

- Healthier Wales and action being taken on an Obesity Strategy
- Cardiff and Vale Regional Partnership funding for transparency in how the fund is used the impact the project has in addressing mental health and wellbeing agenda including loneliness, meeting dementia needs and ensuring leisure and housing are also met.
- The timeframe for Cardiff to achieve Dementia Friendly City status.
- Get Me Home pilot was welcomed and working towards getting patients home to safe and supported environment.

7. [Cabinet Member, Strategic Planning & Transport Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded questions on

- Air Quality and heavy goods vehicles around schools and play areas.
- Efforts to change the modal split in particular as part of the new development across Cardiff but in particular in the north west (Plasdŵr) and north east of the city.
- The Nextbike scheme and arrangements to collect abandoned cycles.

- The financial viability of the Nextbike scheme.

8. [Cabinet Member, Investment & Development Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on

- The renovation of the Cardiff Bay Station building
- Progress on the Cardiff Bus Station development – this was a matter for the Cabinet Member for Transport and planning
- The availability of office space and tension with the development of sites for student accommodation. The Cabinet Member advised that the demand was for high quality office accommodation and that there was a need to upgrade lower graded accommodation so that we had a range of options for businesses wanting to relocate to Cardiff. The Cabinet Member was not aware of any tension between the requirements for the different range of accommodation need in Cardiff.

9. [Cabinet Member, Culture & Leisure Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on

- Welcomed the participation of the Council in National Tree week.
- Tree planting advice for residents to be available on the website.
- ONS 30% of greenery available in the street scene
- Thanks to staff for the provisioning and supporting getting a Christmas Tree for the Fairwater Ward.

10. [The Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member Education, Employment and Skills Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on

- Welcome the Council's steps in becoming a UNCR Child Friendly through the launch of the Cardiff Child Friendly City Strategy and its 17 goals, and the importance of the work being undertaken across Council with UNICEF. It was important however not to exclude children and young people including disabled children who required assisted transport to enable them to fulfil their learning needs and desires.
- Congratulated Radyr Comprehensive School for its performance in public examination and its achievements resulting in it being named the best Comprehensive school in Wales.

105 : MOTION 1

The Lord Mayor advised that the notice of motion proposed by Councillor Dilwar Ali and seconded by Councillor Mackie had been received for consideration and was included on the Summons for the meeting. One amendment had been received.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Dilwar Ali to propose the motion as follows:

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

Cardiff is known to be a dog loving city and many of our residents pay large sums of money for the puppy of their choice, sometimes thousands of pounds. This love of dogs is being abused by illegal puppy farm owners who keep breeding dogs in very poor conditions and continually breed them. They also produce puppies who in poor health, that are taken from their mothers too early, often causing them to have problems socialising. They cost their new owners large sums in vet's bills that often still end in the pup dying or being unmanageable. Lucy was one of these breeding dogs who was rescued from a puppy farm and Lucy's Law is a campaign to ban the third-party sales of pups to help stop this.

Cardiff Dogs Home, a service run by Cardiff Council, is having to take in some of these pups to try and rehome them. We know that areas in West Wales have an increasing number of illegal puppy farms using third parties to sell the pups and that pups are sold in Cardiff.

The UK Government have agreed to ban third party sales of puppies in England and three Assembly Members are asking the Welsh Government to follow suit as without Lucy's Law illegal puppy farm breeding dogs and their puppies in Wales will continue to languish behind closed doors, suffering at the hands of people who put profit before animal welfare.

This Council calls for the Leader of Cardiff Council to write to the Welsh Government, supporting the call for urgent action to ban the third-party sales of puppies.

The motion was formally seconded by Councillor Mackie.

#### Amendment 1

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Tim Davies to propose the amendment received in accordance with CPR (r) as follows:

Paragraph 3 - After "...suffering at the hands of people who put profit before animal welfare" add new sentence.

*Cardiff Council will continue to recognise that it is important to address the wider problem of cruelty to all animals*

The amendment was formally seconded by Councillor Hudson.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion and the amendment.

At the end of the debate Councillor Dilwar Ali confirmed that he did not accept the amendment. The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Dilwar Ali to respond to matters raised during the debate before the votes were taken.

The Vote on the Amendment as proposed by Councillor Tim Davies was **LOST**.

The Vote on the Original Motion as proposed by Councillor Dilwar Ali was **CARRIED** unanimously as follows:

Cardiff is known to be a dog loving city and many of our residents pay large sums of money for the puppy of their choice, sometimes thousands of pounds. This love of dogs is being abused by illegal puppy farm owners who keep breeding dogs in very poor conditions and continually breed them. They also produce puppies who in poor health, that are taken from their mothers too early, often causing them to have problems socialising. They cost their new owners large sums in vet's bills that often still end in the pup dying or being unmanageable. Lucy was one of these breeding dogs who was rescued from a puppy farm and Lucy's Law is a campaign to ban the third-party sales of pups to help stop this.

Cardiff Dogs Home, a service run by Cardiff Council, is having to take in some of these pups to try and rehome them. We know that areas in West Wales have an increasing number of illegal puppy farms using third parties to sell the pups and that pups are sold in Cardiff.

The UK Government have agreed to ban third party sales of puppies in England and three Assembly Members are asking the Welsh Government to follow suit as without Lucy's Law illegal puppy farm breeding dogs and their puppies in Wales will continue to languish behind closed doors, suffering at the hands of people who put profit before animal welfare.

This Council calls for the Leader of Cardiff Council to write to the Welsh Government, supporting the call for urgent action to ban the third-party sales of puppies.

106 : MOTION 2

The Lord Mayor advised that the notice of motion proposed by Councillor Dilwar Ali and seconded by Councillor Mackie had been received for consideration and was included on the Summons for the meeting. One amendment had been received.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Hudson to propose the motion as follows:

This Council is committed to supporting citizens and families who live with dementia and to making Cardiff a recognized dementia friendly city, a place where people affected by dementia can continue to prosper and enjoy life safe in the knowledge that the wider community is understanding and supportive of their needs.

This Council notes that

- Familiarity of location and care is considered essential for many people who are suffering from dementia and a local day centre helps prevent citizens from becoming geographically disorientated.
- A day centre with dementia services raises awareness of the issue in the local community.
- The current Council funded day centres are logistically situated in the east and west of the city. There are no direct bus routes from the most northern wards of Cardiff to the current day centres and direct VEST community transport can take up to an hour in heavy traffic. The current

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

day centres, whilst excellent in themselves, do not have the capacity to adequately provide for the needs of all older residents across Cardiff.

This Council calls on the Cabinet to establish a stand-alone Council funded day centre which offers dementia services in the north of the City of Cardiff, where the concentration of older citizens is at its highest, by the end of this Council's term of office in 2022 and draw up a timetable for the accreditation of Cardiff as a Dementia Friendly City.

The motion was formally seconded by Councillor Owen.

#### Amendment 1

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Carter to propose the amendment received in accordance with CPR (r) as follows:

Delete the final paragraph and replace with the following:

*This Council calls on the Cabinet to:*

- *Work with the Cardiff and Vale University Health Board and the Alzheimer's Society to map the needs of people living with dementia across Cardiff and establish where additional services are needed, in particular in the North of Cardiff.*
- *Protect and expand the services available in the two council-run day centres and the Alzheimer's Society service at Oldwell Court.*
- *Draw up a timetable for the accreditation of Cardiff as a Dementia Friendly City.*

The motion was formally seconded by Councillor Howells.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion and the amendment.

At the end of the debate Councillor Hudson confirmed that she did not accept the amendment. The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Hudson to respond to matters raised during the debate before the votes were taken.

The Vote on the Amendment as proposed by Councillor Carter was **CARRIED**.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Carter to give the right of reply on the Substantive Motion. Councillor Carter thanked fellow Councillors for their very moving contributions in particular those from Councillors Stubbs, Cowan, Molik and Howells; and thanked the Cabinet Members, Councillors Thorne and Elsmore for their positive contributions to the debate.

The Vote on the Substantive Motion as proposed by Councillor Carter. The motion was **CARRIED** as follows:

This Council is committed to supporting citizens and families who live with dementia and to making Cardiff a recognized dementia friendly city, a place where people affected by dementia can continue to prosper and enjoy life safe in the knowledge that the wider community is understanding and supportive of their needs.

This Council notes that

- Familiarity of location and care is considered essential for many people who are suffering from dementia and a local day centre helps prevent citizens from becoming geographically disorientated.
- A day centre with dementia services raises awareness of the issue in the local community.
- The current Council funded day centres are logistically situated in the east and west of the city. There are no direct bus routes from the most northern wards of Cardiff to the current day centres and direct VEST community transport can take up to an hour in heavy traffic. The current day centres, whilst excellent in themselves, do not have the capacity to adequately provide for the needs of all older residents across Cardiff.

This Council calls on the Cabinet to:

- Work with the Cardiff and Vale University Health Board and the Alzheimer's Society to map the needs of people living with dementia across Cardiff and establish where additional services are needed, in particular in the North of Cardiff.
- Protect and expand the services available in the two council-run day centres and the Alzheimer's Society service at Oldwell Court.
- Draw up a timetable for the accreditation of Cardiff as a Dementia Friendly City.

#### 107 : ORAL QUESTIONS

Point of Order - *from Councillor McKerlich* in relation to a submitted Written Question which he felt had been rejected as the answer referred the Member to a response to a subsequent Oral Question that had been submitted.

The Monitoring Officer clarified the rules in relation to the rejection of questions and duplication of questions and advised that a response had been given to both the Written and Oral questions in accordance with the current rules.

Question – *Councillor McKerlich*

There is outline planning permission for the first of 4 primary schools on the Plasdwr development but, as yet, no detailed planning permission. Can you outline the

necessary steps to ensure that this school will admit pupils in September 2020 and confirm that these steps will be taken in time to achieve this?

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

I will reply in writing as well via email and I'm also very happy to meet with you to discuss the issue with Officers. As I advised Council in September, the Council expects to bring forward proposals for new school provision in the North West of Cardiff and to consult widely on these proposals with stakeholders, including local members, early in 2019.

No commitment has been made to establish the school to serve the Plasdŵr pupils by September 2020.

The Council must comply with the statutory processes set out in the School Organisation Code when establishing new school provision.

The Cabinet will consider a report on new school provision for Plasdŵr prior to consultation and must then consider the outcome of that consultation in order to formally declare its intention to establish a school. A later meeting of the Cabinet would be required to determine the proposal.

I would expect the developers to submit a planning application to build the school in 2019, and for a build programme of 12-14 months, meaning that the school would be ready in summer 2021. The timing of new school provision is extremely important, the phasing of new school provision is carefully planned to avoid destabilising existing schools in closest proximity to the sites. As 30 - 60 additional places of entry to school is a significant risk to the existing schools, as of 21<sup>st</sup> November 2018, there were 58 houses occupied and 27 pupils in total across all school age groups on the first phases of the development. There are 6 pupils resident who are due to enter reception year in September 2019. Local Members will be consulted on the proposals and the planned establishment date in 2019, I will send you the rest of my reply by email.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor McKerlich*

In teaching and learning, the emphasis nowadays is on outcome rather than process, so when will you manage to get across to Officers that when it comes to building a new school the outcome is just as important as process. In this particular case, they have not even started consultation 2 years after it was agreed in principle. The principle developer on the site has been expecting to be told for quite some time when he could move towards applying for detailed planning permission.

I note that your view based on the officer's advice is that only 6 children will be involved and I hope that my fellow Councillors in Llandaff, Creigiau, Fairwater and Pentyrch, and all wards will be touched by this. For the last 5 years I personally have been involved in endless arguments about children trying to get into schools because of a shortage of school places. I will be astonished if my ward plus the other 4 wards doesn't come to more than 6 children in 1 years' time.

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

I think the Officers were very clear what they thought the outcome would be of adding 30-60 additional school places at a time where there are only 6 additional pupils expected on the roll in the next academic year and they have also informed me that Radyr Primary, Bryn Derw, Danescourt, Peter Lea, Ysgol Coed Y Gof and Gwaelod Y Garth were all able to admit all catchment pupils and pupils from outside their catchment area last time around.

The outcome of putting in school places too early isn't going to give parents a better chance of education it will destabilise existing schools and possibly leave them with the financial legacy that can last for years if they then incurred a deficit.

Question – *Councillor Berman*

Because Howardian Primary is accessed by cul-de-sacs on either side of the school site, this means parents dropping off their children at the start of the school day, or collecting them at the end of the school day, have to undertake three-point-turns and this leads to a degree of traffic chaos in those surrounding streets with potentially dangerous manoeuvres having to be undertaken. With the council and its developer partners, Wates Residential, now taking forward plans for a housing development on the adjacent site of the former Howardian Centre, will the council please look again at the idea of incorporating into this new development a transport solution which could avoid the need for three-point turns to be undertaken by parents when dropping off or picking up their children?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

We are aware of issues around that school and are implementing all sorts of local measures and numerous transport solutions but we are keen to hear which of the transport solutions you would like to take forward and I can respond on that.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Berman*

I think it's easily solvable, the problem is that parents come in to drop their children off they have to come in by a Cul-de-Sac by the side of the school and therefore they somehow have to turn around to get out of that cul-de-sac again which inevitably means they are doing 3 point turns, that can be dangerous there could be children trying to walk to school going through this chaos so it's just a terrible situation.

We have been suggesting for some time, we have spoken to Council Officers, my predecessor colleagues in the ward submitted petitions. As part of the development there is an opportunity to have a through route from one side to the other passed the school, not as part of the school grounds but would you consider either having a through route or putting aside some of the area so that there can be a turning area so that cars can come in and turn around and come out again in a forward motion where it is not causing a danger.

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

I will ask them to look at it but there are a couple of things that stand out there, one bit of evidence that we know around transport is putting through roads near schools creates more traffic and more speed which is what nearly every other ward comes and tells me, they don't want this by their schools.

What is happening in this ward, from what I can understand, is that the school have been putting forward an active travel plan for the school that includes 20 mph zones, more people cycling to the school, they are starting a school bus, they are the kind of things I would expect you to get behind and support, rather than working out how we can get people in their cars quickly to that school, dropping kids off as quick as they can rather than the longer term impacts. That is what we are working on with that school, if you think that is wrong or you think we should take something else forward then I will take that up with Officers.

Question – *Councillor Ford*

Can you provide an update with the works ongoing at Waungron Road?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

Contractors are currently on site undertaking clearance and remediation works. This phase of the development is substantially complete.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Ford*

Could you say why a Labour Party Ward has been updated about Waungron Road but us as Local Ward Councillors haven't been?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

If anyone asks me questions about Waungron Road I'm happy to answer. You haven't asked me a question previously about Waungron Road I would have given you an update anytime you asked me. We are looking to progress it all the time. Ask me a question, I'll answer.

Question – *Councillor Gordon*

Castle Street from the corner with Working Street to Canton Bridge is risky for cyclists. Yet it is a key connection to the City Centre and an east/west route. The Castle Street road surface is uneven and there are high kerbs by the bus stop outside the Holiday Inn. The challenging cycling experience is particularly difficult from the Holiday Inn entrance to Canton Bridge. Have the Council any proposals to make Castle Street safer for cyclists?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

As cycling champion long before all these Johnny come lately's that are jumping on the cycling bandwagon now we have a yellow jersey, I know you have been

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

campaigning for many years to see better cycling and infrastructure. That area is problematic that stretch of road, although it should be noted there are a lot of other improvements in that vicinity, it is included in our integrated network map to make improvements around Castle Street and we are going all out to obtain funding as quickly as we can to improve active travel infrastructure in that area.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Gordon*

What is the proposed timeline for the Castle street improvements?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

We're currently uncertain of the exact date, it does depend on the funding we receive. We are trying to fast track, what was a fifteen year cycling vision, into the next three to five years we haven't yet obtained that funding however we are hopeful that in January we will have a clearer understanding of when these improvements can take place.

Question – *Councillor Hudson*

Regarding the progress of the hybrid parking scheme which was promised to be initiated in September this year, can we see the start of an outline or consultation questions before too long?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

We have met and had good conversation with a number of different ward colleagues not just from your ward but from around there as well. There have been a couple of considerations we have had to take into account not least the impact on other wards and we are now going to look to do the scheme across Llandaff North and some of Whitchurch as well so we want to make sure we get that right and consult with those Members, that said it will require a bit of compromise, the streets are very compact, lots of people trying to use it, not least the University Health Board Wales but officers are working up a scheme that hopefully you will be happy with.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Hudson*

Would it be possible to discuss this so that we can progress as soon as possible?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

We will have this discussion within the next month or so.

Question – *Councillor Molik*

How many nursing home provisions are we losing in Cardiff with time due to inadequate service or lack of staff?

Reply – *Councillor Elsmore*

At this time 30 registered nursing beds will be lost to Cardiff following the decision taken by a care home provider who has taken the decision to withdraw its nursing registration. The decision was related both to the quality of care, and the corresponding inability to recruit suitably qualified and experienced nursing staff.

Where the Council identifies concerns related to the quality of nursing provision, it works jointly with Cardiff & Vale University Health Board (UHB), Care Inspectorate Wales (CIW), and other stakeholders, together with the provider to ensure that the necessary corrective actions are undertaken in a timely way to enable the provider to continue to operate safely.

For the medium- and longer-term, we are working together with partners to develop a range of services for older people that will enable individuals to live at home, thus preventing the need for people to move into care homes. This includes community support through: the Community Resource Team, Independent Living Services, housing adaptations and assisted technology; reviewing domiciliary care services; and developing a range of housing and support services specifically for older people.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Molik*

As you would imagine it was devastating for families and residents to find out they have one month to relocate their loved ones who are at a vulnerable stage of their life, within a month, so it's been a difficult phase.

What did you know and when did you know about the potential closure of nursing home at Sunrise care home?

Reply – *Councillor Elsmore*

I don't think it's an appropriate question Lord Mayor in terms of what I knew and when.

I would also just want to ask you to be very cautionary in terms of some of the actions taken by your group in so far as this is concerned. We have proper processes and I am assured by those as I am absolutely assured by the fact that our officers that are working tirelessly with the health board and the regulator in terms of finding new accommodation for the individuals impacted.

Question – *Councillor Parry*

Can you advise if and when the bus exchange is going to open?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

Can you explain which 'bus exchange' you are referring to because there are about 3 that we are working on at the moment?

Clarification - *Councillor Parry*

This is the Bus exchange that was going to be built on Waungron Road recycling site on Waungron Road and Western Avenue

Reply - *Councillor Wild*

We are working with developers Link Housing to bring that forward, it's in their hands at the moment we are hoping that it comes to planning early in the New Year.

As the project is being taken forward by a third party, I am unable to say when the interchange facility will open; however I can advise that it will be provided as part of the development.

Question – *Councillor Bridgeman*

Will the Cabinet Member provide an update on the Council's progress on moving people into new properties?

Reply – *Councillor Thorne*

I am pleased to say that 13 new Council homes, delivered through the Cardiff Living Programme in St Mellons and Llanrumney, have been offered to applicants on the Housing Waiting List.

4 families have now moved into their new homes and it is anticipated the remainder will be moving in next month.

Properties are built to Lifetime Homes standards, with the potential to adapt, and I am pleased to say that it has been possible to offer two of the homes to families with disabled children.

The allocation of the social rented units will focus on promoting a settled, cohesive and desirable place to live, whilst at the same time meeting demand for applicants on the waiting list.

Special lettings arrangements have also been agreed for each development to achieve this balance, whilst also giving some local people a chance to move and remain within their community. Ward members have also been consulted on this lettings initiative.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Bridgeman*

With over 8000 people on the Council housing waiting list, every Saturday when Keith Heather and I hold our weekly advice surgery, we are met with people in acute distress as they desperately seek accommodation within a close distance of the communities they are integral to. The news that Cardiff Councils Cardiff living programme is delivering new homes to Cardiff families is wonderful.

Last week I toured the new Council home in Llanrumney with Councillor Jones, the first in Llanrumney for decades, it was stunning it was beautiful, the next day the keys to that property were to be handed over to a new Llanrumney family.

What are the next steps the Council can take to work with developers and the Welsh Government to build much more social housing in our capital city?

Reply – *Councillor Thorne*

I have visited the social housing homes within Llanrumney and agree that they are superb. On the estates that we have developed in Llanrumney and St Mellons you would be hard pressed to find a difference between the private and social sector, the big difference is that the Council home are actually better because the internal standards are much larger.

In terms of building more, we have a commitment to build a further 1000 social houses by 2022. We have also have an ambition to identify potential land to build a further 2175 houses. You may also be aware the Welsh government have lifted the cap so we are looking to see how we can actually move that ambition up to 3000.

Question – *Councillor Graham Thomas*

With multiple LDP strategic sites now at a construction stage all along the A4119, many residents are complaining about HGVs coming through rural villages and using local roads and lanes. How are the Council working with developers and their contractors to prevent this and keep to the agreed routes?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

It is a concern and it's something I've been paying attention to. Conditions were attached to the outline planning permissions in North West Cardiff to require the submission and approval of a Construction Environmental Management Plan. We have had discussions with the developers to remind them of their duties, local residents have also been putting pressure on some of the developers as well.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Graham Thomas*

You will be aware of the signs that have gone up around Radyr already diverting these HGV's from Heol Isaf and going through the village. Of course there are other hot spots already suffering from this blight including Church Road and Cardiff Road in Creigiau particularly when planning permission for the site south of Creigiau is fully approved.

Do you think these signs have been effective and can I ask you replicate these signs on other routes the contractors are currently taking but are not a part of the agreed routes?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

I believe we should replicate the signs. I think they have helped and we have been encouraging the police to get involved. This helps the public understand what is expected of the drivers when taking these routes.

Question – *Councillor Howells*

How long should residents have to wait for publically discarded drug paraphernalia, such as used needles, to be removed from the time that they are reported to the Council?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

Once reported, cleansing staff aim to remove needles and drug paraphernalia within 48 hours in line with service standards.

Teams are also proactive on their daily rounds and will remove needles and other drug paraphernalia on a daily basis if they come across them.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Howells*

I asked this question about how quickly glass is removed a few months back and that was within 24 hours, so the fact that needles are taking longer to discard worries me a bit. At the last Adamsdown PACT meeting residents did raise concerns about this with particular reference to Cemetery Park. We heard from residents how, when they reported things like this to the Council the response they received was satisfactory and it took many days for these syringes to be resolved and sometimes the residents had to take the matters into their own hands and collect them which as you know isn't advisable.

Could I ask you liaise with your colleagues to come up with an action plan to see how we can tackle this issue of discarded needles particularly in Cemetery Park?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

I understand this is an issue within your ward (Adamsdown) and I am more than happy to arrange a meeting involving the relevant councillors to come up with a resolution to this problem.

Question – *Councillor Keith Parry*

What provision does the Council intend to make for the monitoring of air pollution along the heavily congested roads in Fairwater and can you advise on when air quality monitoring stations will be installed in the congestion areas in Fairwater and Pentrebane?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

In terms of prioritising air quality sampling locations, the Council adopts a risk based approach to the allocation of monitoring sites, considering the requirements of appropriate national guidance.

Currently, there is no local ambient air quality monitoring undertaken in the Fairwater or Pentrebanne areas. However, low background levels of key pollutants in the area provide some reassurance in terms of there being a large margin between these levels and the legal Air Quality Objective for those pollutants.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Keith Parry*

I have noticed the air quality is monitored on the A119 through Llandaff. I'm concerned about the future when the Plas Dwr development is built that there will be a considerable increase of volume of traffic through Fairwater particularly along St Fagans Rd. between the Green and Waungron Road.

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

I am happy to pass your concerns onto officer that will be meeting soon to discuss when the new monitoring stations will be going out.

Question – *Councillor Lay*

Can the Cabinet Member with responsibility for Ending Violence against Women, Domestic Abuse and Sexual Violence and the Cabinet Member who is the White Ribbon Champion say what the Council has done for White Ribbon Day and is doing during the 16 days of activism following the International Day for the Elimination of Violence against Women?

Reply – *Councillor Elsmore*

The answer is we are doing loads. As my statement outlined some of the things and importantly, the flowerbed outside Cardiff Castle has been replicated internationally. Isn't it great that something that starts in the City of Cardiff, other cities around the world want to copy. This year, a bilingual information plaque has been placed by the flower bed to explain what the White Ribbon Campaign is and where people can seek help.

The Council is also working closely with the Glamorgan Branch of Soroptomist International, which is participating in the UN's #Orange the World campaign. This involves placing orange sashes on statues of women throughout the city to mark the UN International Day to Eliminate Violence against Women and Girls on 25<sup>th</sup> November (which is also White Ribbon Day), and this will run for 16 days through to Human Rights Day on 10<sup>th</sup> December. We have sought to align the two campaigns by also pinning a White Ribbon to the orange sashes. Male colleagues did the Walk with Officers 'A Mile in her Shoes'.

The Council has also been promoting an active social media campaign that is running from 23<sup>rd</sup> November until 10<sup>th</sup> December, with the hashtag #whiteribboncardiffvale. Information about the White Ribbon campaign and local events has also been shared via the Council's Intranet.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Lay*

Can we ensure all of that information is accessible to the public in places such as Hubs?

Reply – *Councillor Elsmore*

I completely agree, and will make sure to check all of that information is absolutely accessible. I would also like to note our officers are currently working with groups such as school children, Beavers and Cubs to relay the importance of that message to young children.

Question – *Councillor Robson*

What consideration has been given to formally appointing a Cabinet Member as the Council's Disability and Inclusion Champion?

Reply – *Councillor Weaver*

As you will recall, the Cabinet agreed in July last year to absorb and mainstream Member Champion or Lead Member roles within relevant Cabinet Member portfolio responsibilities.

As the Cabinet Member with responsibility for Finance, Modernisation and Performance, equality and diversity matters fall within my portfolio. I am very committed to working with council officers and Members to progress equality for all.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Robson*

I have sat through a couple of committees where issues regarding disabled groups particularly had, have been flagged up and coming within different portfolios. So what I'm seeking assurance for is that there is a cross cutting emphasis on helping those who have a disability and access services where either the Council have direct responsibility or even indirect responsibility.

The Public Protection Committee had a very good session with the issues regarding taxis which is indirect. Councillor Bradbury will recall the dog fouling issue where the Guide Dogs for the Blind raised concerns, I'm conscious that is cross cutting across the whole Council.

I appreciate it's your portfolio but does a champion need to be put back in place in this area?

Reply – *Councillor Weaver*

One thing I would reassure you of, every Cabinet Member understands everyone has a role to play in terms of their service area. Wherever we hear the information coming from about a problem that need solving or somewhere we could improve every Cabinet Member would take that very seriously.

I think having the Member Champion roles absorbed within the Cabinet Portfolios does make sense. There are always going to be challenges with those that are as you say are very cross cutting where information can come from anywhere. I hope you have raised this with other Cabinet Members as well as it is always good to hear that feedback from across the city.

Question – *Councillor Taylor*

Following the announcement that Welsh Government will now cover 65% of the costs of council's Band B schemes, what implications does this have for any potential savings for Cardiff Council?

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

The Council is currently in discussion with Welsh Government about the implications of the intervention rate change for Band B of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century School Programme.

As the amount of capital available from Welsh Government is not increasing at this point, the Council is seeking clarification of the impact that this rate change will have on the capital profiling of the proposed programme.

The Council is funding its share of the programme capital via prudential borrowing and through capital receipts from the disposal of surplus sites. At this early stage, it is not clear what the precise impact on potential savings could be.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Taylor*

If there are savings to be realised my understanding is we could be looking at tens of millions of pounds in terms of the upfront costs. Will we be looking to develop new schemes particularly for those category C schools and to realise the recent developments around the increasing capacity in the Welsh medium provision in the centre and north of the city?

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

I hope that in the future the circumstances will be better so that we can have that conversation. What I am concerned about it that the suggestion that band B might be extended. To my mind extending band B is in effect putting schools back into band C. That's my understanding at present.

Question – *Councillor Kelloway*

Could the cabinet member please update us on the plans for a new recycling centre in the North of the city?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

Officers are currently reviewing the business case and location options for a new recycling centre and will be making recommendations back to Cabinet in the New Year.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Kelloway*

That is welcome news. It has been nine months since the closure of Wedal Road. Residents in the north of the city were promised a replacement centre.

Why have you failed to even identify a site and why is it not up and running yet?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

I am currently looking for a site in Whitchurch, Rhiwbina, Llanishen, Cyncoed most of the north of Cardiff. When we have located a site I will report back.

Question – *Councillor Boyle*

The share price of IQE, which received almost £40m of City Deal money, has dropped by about 55% in the past year. How robust was the assessment of its business model and who, on Cardiff Council, sanctioned the investment?

Reply – *Councillor Huw Thomas*

It wasn't Cardiff Council who sanctioned the investment this was a matter undertaken by the joint Cabinet of the City Deal. For the record I understand the vote taken on the 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2017 Cardiff abstained.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Boyle*

It sounds in that statement that notion of the Capital Region Cabinet collective responsibility just fell off its perch.

We must hope that IQE can find the short sellers though of course Brexit, competitors in Asia, cash shortfalls and so on could of course jeopardise the situation further, but if things do continue to go wrong there will be questions asked about the processes underpinning these decisions, and in particular what due diligence was carried out and by who.

Are you comfortable that the IQE deal was subject to appropriate scrutiny and if so why was this massive share price fall not anticipated?

Reply – *Councillor Huw Thomas*

I think you are in danger of getting a reputation as a doom monger given your question on my statement as well.

It is worth noting that the share price of IQE currently is roughly what the share price was around the time that City Deal took the decision to invest in the combust semiconductor foundry, which is a project of course that has far more stakeholders than just IQE. I think when you look at IQE in the round you will see that it is a company that is in good health with assets of over £30million this year, and when you look at the investment deal, there were good reasons for Cardiff's abstention at the time particularly around the timescales of the decision where the decision was taken 2 days before a local election. However I think the due diligence around the process has been robust, a Welsh Audit Office report I believe will satisfy itself on that case as well and ultimately what we are looking at is a proposition where for a commitment of £38million we unlock close to £400million of private sector investment with the opportunity to create a huge future looking business and industry in South Wales and for that I think we should all be supportive and I think we should do well to look at the rounder picture rather than just look at some headlines.

Question – *Councillor Kelloway*

Could the Cabinet Member please update us on changes to care provision at the Cyncoed Sunrise Care Home?

Reply – *Councillor Elsmore*

Sunrise Senior Living is a residential and nursing home provider situated in the Cyncoed area of Cardiff, which is registered with Care Inspectorate Wales for a total of 107 beds. Currently, there are 14 individuals placed at the home by Cardiff Social Services, of which 8 receive residential care, and 6 nursing care. There are also 12 self-funding individuals who receive nursing care.

As a result of the inability of the registered provider to recruit the quality of nursing staff necessary to address concerns raised by both the Care Inspectorate Wales (CIW) inspections, and Cardiff & Vale University Health Board (UHB) nurse assessors, the provider took the decision to cease nursing care. The care home will continue to operate as a residential care provider only.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Kelloway*

Just for clarification what actions of the Lib Dems were you referring to but also why did the Council not warn Ward members of the impending closure of the Sunrise Care Home nursing section until residents were told to leave with only 30 days' notice and has the Council secured suitable alternative accommodation for all of those affected?

Reply – *Councillor Elsmore*

What is really important to understand is the sensitivity of the situation. Also to place on record the responsibility. This is an independent care provider and is registered with Care Inspectorate Wales. The nursing care is often provided, commissioned through the Health board. Our role is as the safeguarding authority we also commission some beds.

I am happy to have discussions offline but I'm not going to go into details in relation to when, where and what. What's really important and what I want to avoid going forward, particularly if we have concerns in our market, particularly in relation to nursing care, is that we have transparent and robust processes that local Ward Members can reply upon.

Question – *Councillor Molik*

The Cardiff LDP suggested the importance of equalities impact assessment in communities on planning grounds. Is it right for planning officers and committee to brush all areas in the same colour and apply same policy disregarding differences in population demographics and public transport provisions in the area i.e. should Cyncoed be classed as the same as other areas in city centre?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

The purpose of the LDP Equalities Impact Assessment was to provide a high level tool, which was used during preparation of the Plan to ensure that its policies and proposals promote equality and diversity and do not adversely or discriminate against any of the groups protected under the Equality Act 2010.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Molik*

My concern was really are we just paying lip service to those policies and Equalities Act because with Cyncoed being brushed with the same brush as many other wards in Cardiff City Centre where we know we have an older demographic, we know the buses don't reach certain patches of Cyncoed and if they do reach they are either half hourly or hourly as opposed to other wards who have the luxury of buses every 5 to 10 minutes coming into the wards.

Is it right for Cyncoed to be seen through the same lens as other wards in Cardiff centre?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

In terms of the equality impact assessment of the LDP it would be problematic of us to pick every street and every ward to treat in a different way across all of Cardiff because there's all sorts of different protected characteristic groups. It would almost be impossible to get that right. In terms of the other issues around housing and transport, I'm happy to take that up there is a housing strategy on the way that you and your residents will be interested in.

Question – *Councillor Parkhill*

Do you think it is acceptable that hygiene bags containing human excrement were left for three days uncollected across Llanishen and Thornhill this week?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

Any non-collection is not acceptable.

Unfortunately, a vehicle breakdown on Friday 23<sup>rd</sup> November meant that it was not possible to complete the hygiene collections in Llanishen and Thornhill.

The waste was collected the next working day on Monday 26<sup>th</sup> November. Where hygiene waste is not collected for any reason, we aim to collect within 2 working days and, on this occasion, we remained within our service standards. However, I appreciate that, where operational issues arise on a Friday, this can mean that waste remains uncollected over the weekend.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Parkhill*

As the Council has its own vehicle maintenance facilities are the servicing regimes that are currently in place suitable based on the number of collections that seemed to be missed on a frequent basis across the city?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

The Council doesn't run its own servicing facilities. They're currently under contract with our hirer. This will be changing in the future but unfortunately isn't available at present.

Question – *Councillor Hudson*

Are the Council looking to transfer all of our green sports pitches to leisure clubs on long leases?

Reply – *Councillor Bradbury*

No.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Hudson*

We're effectively losing control of all our green spaces. Is this really what the Council wants for the City of Cardiff or more particularly condones?

Reply – *Councillor Bradbury*

As an experienced Councillor she should know that she can't make assertions like the one she has just made without any evidence. I'm guessing she is looking at the budget consultation document which says "we are continuing to transfer sports buildings to local sporting clubs", something that has been ongoing for several years since austerity started. There are no plans at all to transfer our green spaces neither

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

is there a proposal here to do so and without austerity we wouldn't even be looking to transfer sports buildings either, but who is at fault for that – it is not my side it is yours.

108 : URGENT BUSINESS

There was no urgent business for this meeting.

109 : CARDIFF BUS - APPOINTMENT OF INDEPENDENT NON-EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS

The Council was requested to consider changes to the Council's appointed representatives to Cardiff Bus, including the appointment of two Independent Non-Executive Directors.

RESOLVED – That

1. the reduction in the number of Non-Executive Director positions allocated for the appointment of Councillors to the Board of Cardiff City Transport Services Limited from seven to five was approved;
2. nominations and confirm the appointment of five Councillors to serve as Non-Executive Directors of Cardiff City Transport Services Limited would be requested from Party Groups and reported to the next meeting;
3. subject to the proposed amendments to the Company's Articles, the allocation of two Non-Executive Director positions for the appointment of independent persons to the Board of Cardiff City Transport Services Limited (i.e. who are neither Elected Members of the Council nor employees of the Council or the Company) was approved;
4. subject to the proposed amendments to the Company's Articles, the appointment of two independent Non-Executive Directors (to be selected as set out in recommendation 5) on an interim basis for a 12-month period was approved;
5. subject to the proposed amendments to the Company's Articles, delegate authority to the Corporate Director Resources, in consultation with the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance, to procure two appropriately qualified individuals to serve as the interim independent Non-Executive Directors was agreed;
6. subject to the proposed amendments to the Company's Articles, delegate authority to the Director of Governance & Legal and Monitoring Officer to undertake a public appointment process in 2019/20 for the two Independent Non-Executive Director positions and oversee the shortlisting and interview process for the appointments based on the establishment of a politically balanced Member Appointment Panel was agreed;

7. it was noted that the Corporate Director Resources continues to carry out the Council's role as Shareholder of Cardiff City Transport Services Limited.

110 : LOCAL AUTHORITY GOVERNOR APPOINTMENTS

The Council was requested to approve the recommendations of the Local Authority Governor Panel 19 November 2018.

RESOLVED – That

1. the following appointments be approved to existing vacancies: -

School	Ward	Start of Vacancy	Appointment Approved
Allensbank Primary School	Gabalfa	12/07/2018	Antony Powell
Eastern High	Trowbridge	24/10/2018	Ruth Morgan
Glan-Yr-Afon Primary School	Llanrumney	28/03/2018	Jean Fudge
Llanishen High School	Llanishen	27/09/2018	Cllr John Lancaster
Ninian Park Primary School	Grangetown	06/03/2018	Joseph Edwards
Pontpennau Primary School	Pontpennau & Old St Mellons	31/08/2018 21/09/2018	John Morley Suzannah Edmondson
Roath Park Primary School	Plasnewdd	03/10/2018	Bethan Proctor
Springwood Primary School	Pentwyn	13/02/2018	Siân Sarwar
Ysgol Gyfun Gymraeg Bro Ederm	Penylan	22/01/2018	Cadan ap Tomos

2. the following appointments be approved to future Local Authority vacancies

School	Ward	Start of Vacancy	Appointment Approved
Federation of Greenway Primary School & Trowbridge Primary School	Rumney & Trowbridge	08/01/18 08/01/18 08/01/18 08/01/18	Sean Colsey Emily Daly Korin Jones Emma Tobutt
Bryn Deri Primary School	Radyr & Morganstown	01/01/19	Angharad Thomas - Richards
Christ The King R.C Primary School	Llanishen	30/01/19	Sara Beal
Gabalfa Primary School	Llandaff North	27/03/19	Cllr Dilwar Ali

<b>School</b>	<b>Ward</b>	<b>Start of Vacancy</b>	<b>Appointment Approved</b>
Grangetown Nursery School	Grangetown	27/03/19	Wendy Thomas
Grangetown Primary School	Grangetown	30/01/19	Jeff Hobden
Herbert Thompson Primary School	Ely	25/03/19	Barbara Cooke
Kitchener Primary School	Riverside	26/02/19	Gwilym Owen
Pen-Y-Bryn Primary School	Llanrumney	27/03/19	Claire Deguara
St Peter's R.C Primary School	Plasnewydd	26/02/19	Julia Houlston Clarke
The Bishop Of Llandaff C.W High School	Llandaff	28/01/19	Susan Golding
Ysgol Gynradd Gwaelod Y Garth	Pentyrch	25/01/19	Sara Brown
Ysgol Gyfun Gymraeg Glantaf	Llandaff North	15/12/18	Hefin Jones
Ysgol Pen Y Pil	Trowbridge	26/03/19	Sian Poole

111 : APPOINTMENT OF COUNCIL REPRESENTATIVES ON OUTSIDE BODIES

The Council was requested to approve nominations received from Party Group for vacancies as set out on the amendment sheet.

RESOLVED – That the following nominations as Cardiff Council representatives on Outside Bodies be approved:

<b>Body</b>	<b>Appointment</b>
Grassroots(Cardiff) Ltd	Councillor Norma Mackie
Standing Advisory Council for Religious Education (SACRE)	Councillor Fenella Bowden

112 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 17 (f) [Written Questions](#) received for consideration and response had been published.

*The meeting ended at 21.00pm*